

Peer Reviewer: Ashley Tapia

ENG_10108 J.Poe F18

Author Reviewed: Taha Mohinuddin

Researched Critical Analysis Essay Peer Review

First Impressions

Is there a title? Does it grab your attention? What does it make you think about or wonder?

"The adaption on Star Crossed Lover or the Perfect Women", It did grab my attention, it made me think of fanfiction.

Is there a clear thesis statement? What is it? Can it be argued from supporting or opposing sides?

While many view the movie Devdas as a form a fanfiction of Romeo and Juliet, however, it is the adaption of the plot of Romeo and Juliet. This is done by...

Do you agree or disagree? Why? Why not?

Yes, because she uses the previous paragraphs to explain her thesis.

Where is the thesis located?

3rd paragraph, 1st & 2nd sentence

Arrangement

What is the main form of argumentation and arrangement being used?

She explained the Adaption, then fanfiction, did the thesis she explained with research.

For each section and claim, identify the type of arrangement being used and notate this on their outline. Label each claim with a letter from strongest to weakest, (A being the strongest). What is the order of their presentation?

The whole essay is strong some paragraphs more than others. A-C, first two are B then A, A, B, B, A, B, B, C.

Is this the most logical arrangement? What other forms and order would make more sense, or be more persuasive? Suggest two areas and forms for consideration.

Its the most logical arrangement to the writer. If J.Poe says its okay to make long paragraphs she can be better, if not it still makes sense. Thesis is 3rd paragraph which is odd but A's. Conclusion needs a lot more, like a summary of the essay and what she feels.

What objections do you have to this argument?

NO, objections to this argument, Maybe that the thesis is in the 2nd paragraph because its not usually where its located, but a big deal.

Circle the opposing viewpoints included? Are they valid and significant reasons to disagree with the writer? Are there enough?

Need more reasons to disagree with the writer, its not enough.

Are you convinced by the conclusion? Why or why not? What else did you want to know?

Not really, its really short and I wanted to know how it all came together/summary and her opinion

What additional information needs to be presented before you can believe the writer has proven and rested their case?

The viewpoints from opposing people or articles...

What is the most interesting thing you learned about this topic?

The difference between the adaption of a text from a function.

What else would convince you to believe the writer is correct?

If the writer would tell her side to what she believes in her argument, more emotional?

Peer Reviewer: Ashley Tapia

ENG_10108 J.Poe F18

Author Reviewed: Ying Xin Jiang

Researched Critical Analysis Essay Peer Review

First Impressions

Is there a title? Does it grab your attention? What does it make you think about or wonder?

Detroit: Become Human - Spontaneous Generation Heaven,
yes, its interesting and it makes me think about video games

Is there a clear thesis statement? What is it? Can it be argued from supporting or opposing sides?

wether or not androids should receive the same rights as humans, and if an android life is comparable or equal to that of a human life.

Do you agree or disagree? Why? Why not?

Agree, because she states that the game makes the player feel attached to the androids.

Where is the thesis located?

2nd to last sentence.

Arrangement

What is the main form of argumentation and arrangement being used?

It follows a 6th paragraph arrangement

For each section and claim, identify the type of arrangement being used and notate this on their outline. Label each claim with a letter from strongest to weakest, (A being the strongest). What is the order of their presentation?

The order of her presentation is A-C, and its very strong from the start, then it ends with a C for the conclusion

Is this the most logical arrangement? What other forms and order would make more sense, or be more persuasive? Suggest two areas and forms for consideration.

Its a good logical arrangement, needs more citations in the paragraphs, and more research.

What objections do you have to this argument?

I don't have any objections to this argument

Circle the opposing viewpoints included? Are they valid and significant reasons to disagree with the writer? Are there enough?

It showed opposing viewpoint and they disagree with the writer. She used a source to show the opposing side.

Are you convinced by the conclusion? Why or why not? What else did you want to know?

A little bit, I felt like it needed more emotion to it? And what the writer believed, her opinion.

What additional information needs to be presented before you can believe the writer has proven and rested their case?

Outside information of how other people feel about this.

What is the most interesting thing you learned about this topic?

The game makes the player feel attached to the life-like androids.

What else would convince you to believe the writer is correct?

If she showed more of her opinion towards this.